

New Orleans Historic District Landmarks Commission
Architectural Review Committee
Meeting Minutes

Date: August 1, 2017

Location: City Hall, 1300 Perdido Street, 8th Floor Homeland Security Conference Room, New Orleans, Louisiana.

Called to order: 12:30 p.m.

Adjourned: 5:20 p.m.

Members present: Elliott Perkins, Robbie Cangelosi, Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman

Members arriving after beginning of the meeting:

Members absent:

I. AGENDA

1. Approval of the minutes of the June 27, 2017 meeting

Motion: Approve the minutes.

By: Elliott Perkins

Seconded: Robbie Cangelosi

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Cynthia Dubberley, Robbie Cangelosi, John Klingman

Opposed:

Comments:

2. 501 Elysian Fields

Application: Francisco Alecha, applicant; 501 Efa Hotel LLC, owner; Partial demolition of two (2) existing warehouses and new construction of 75,000 SF four-story hotel [DETAIL REVIEW ONLY].

Speakers: Allen Johnson spoke in opposition to the application.

Motion: Robbie Cangelosi made a motion to to defer this application for additional review. The ARC agreed that the plane change between the brick 'plinth' at the first level and stucco above wasn't necessary at the corner elevations at Decatur St and Elysian Fields Ave and could be removed. They also recommended removing the recess at the single casement windows at the Decatur Street elevation shown in plan to align with Room 028 Sales Manager. The ARC recommended lowering the headers (recesses) of the vehicular openings to align with the concrete beam of the service opening at the right side of the Marigny Street elevation. The ARC also recommended raising the bike entrance header to align with the adjacent header heights. They recommended modifying the windows (shown as awning windows) to be wider and taller at the 2nd level of the brick element at the right side of the Decatur Street elevation. The header heights of these windows are to remain and align with the paired windows at the adjacent corner on the Marigny Street elevation. The ARC agreed that a brick course change (running bond to Flemish bond as presented) at the one-story brick portion of the building (between Column line 14 & 19) would be appropriate. They also recommended changing the screening material in the recesses above the vehicular entrances from brick to metal. Regarding the main entry at Elysian Fields Ave, the ARC recommended changing the canopy material to metal as opposed to brick, and raising the height to sit just below the adjacent balconies. Regarding the balconies, the ARC recommended changing the material of the privacy screens to metal and modifying the door to show a pane over panel metal door.

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In Favor: Elliott Perkins, Cynthia Dubberley, Robbie Cangelosi, John Klingman

Opposed:
Comments:

3. 2400 St Charles Ave.
Comments: This application was withdrawn.
4. 1507 Magazine St.
Application: Kim Hosch, applicant; Klaus-Peter Schreiber Trust, The KlausPeter Schreiber Trust, owner;
New construction of one story, detached accessory building for existing hotel.
Speakers: Sonja Mount spoke in opposition to the application.
Motion: Robbie Cangelosi made a motion to defer this application for additional review. The ARC agreed that the applicant should continue to study the site planning strategy and the screening/design of the parking lot. The proposed accessory building should be subordinate to the main buildings, the details should be simplified and less ornate. The structural logic needs to carry through the design.
Second: John Klingman
Result: Passed
In Favor: Elliott Perkins, Robbie Cangelosi, Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman
Opposed:
Comments:
5. 210 State St, Building # 3
Application: 210 State St, Building #3: Kyle Digby, applicant; Children's Hospital, Dept Of Transportation & Development, owner; Restoration of Building 3 which includes removal the second floor gallery, and ancillary additions.
Speakers: Mary Fauning Noraist spoke neutrally regarding the application.
Motion: Robbie Cangelosi made a motion to recommended conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.
Second: Cynthia Dubberley
Result: Passed
In Favor: Elliott Perkins, Cynthia Dubberley, Robbie Cangelosi, John Klingman
Opposed:
Comments:
6. 625 Esplanade St.
Application: 625 Esplanade Ave: Charles Oliver, applicant; Chandelier Development Nola LLC, owner;
Construct three-and half-story, two-family residential building DETAIL REVIEW ONLY.
Motion: Elliot Perkins made a moition to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed the dormer detail drawings require further development. The ARC recommended reducing the slope of the awning to approximately 4:12 maximum. The ARC agreed the balconies appear heavy and recommended reducing the 2x12 structural members. In regards to the underside of the balconies, either exposed or enclosed soffits would be approvable.
Second: Robbie Cangelosi
Result: Passed
In favor: Elliott Perkins, Robbie Cangelosi, Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman
Opposed:
Comments:

7. 1522 Chippewa St.
Application: Robert Boyd, applicant; St. Michael Special School For, owner; Restore circa 1850's Convent building, and construct new chapel addition at the rear.
Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommends conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The railing at the porch entrance should be different from the decorative iron railing. The ARC agreed that the applicant should study the use of the laser cut screen at the overhang at the entrance of the one story building.
Second: Cynthia Dubberley
Result: Passed
In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Robbie Cangelosi, Elliott Perkins, John Klingman
Opposed:
Comments:
8. 2322 St Thomas St.
Application: Katawan Fletcher, applicant/owner; Renovate one-story residential building and construct new camelback addition at rear.
Motion: Cynthia Dubberley made a motion to defer this application for additional review. The ARC agreed that proposal is much improved, but felt the proposed building does not have a strong enough contextual relationship with the surrounding structures. The ARC agreed that the applicant should study flipping the building to its mirror image, pushing the taller portion to the back and bringing the hipped roof forward. Windows sizes and locations need further study, particularly at the front elevation.
Second: Robbie Cangelosi
Result: Passed
In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, Robbie Cangelosi, John Klingman
Opposed:
Comments:
9. 3201 St Claude Ave.
Application: Marguerite Doyle Johnston, applicant; Rose B Paciera, owner; Installation of two 20 ft. shipping containers to provide enclosed storage at existing tire shop.
Speakers: Geraldine S. Paciera spoke in favor of the application.
Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to approve the proposal to install two shipping containers to serve as tire storage.
Second: Robbie Cangelosi
Result: Passed
In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Robbie Cangelosi, Elliott Perkins, John Klingman
Opposed:
Comments:
10. 907 Lizardi St.
Application: Ahmad Larkins, applicant; Demond Cage, owner; Renovation to existing single-family residence (360 SF) and 1,200 SF addition.
Motion: Robbie Cangelosi made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.
Second: Cynthia Dubberley
Result: Passed
In favor: Elliott Perkins, Cynthia Dubberley, Robbie Cangelosi, John Klingman
Opposed:
Comments:
11. 721 Tricou St
Comments: This item was deferred to the end of the agenda.

12. 1244 Constance St
Comments: This item was withdrawn.
13. 1309 Prytania St.
Application: Christopher Johnson, applicant; Marcus E Farrugia, owner; Renovation of existing mixed use building, construct rooftop addition and new courtyard.
Motion: Cynthia Dubberley made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The proposed railing at the top of the building is inappropriate, the ARC recommends extending the parapet to the height required by building code. The parapet should have openings to differentiate from original. The ARC noted that it may be appropriate to use a combination of parapet and railing to achieve the required height provided the railing is minimally visible. The ARC agreed that if this portion of the building requires extensive reconstruction, lowering the ceiling height would help the proportions of the building. The half round detail over the gate should be removed.
Second: Robbie Cangelosi
Result: Passed
In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Robbie Cangelosi, Elliott Perkins, John Klingman
Opposed:
Comments:
14. 2936 Esplanade Ave.
Comments: Item was deferred until applicant arrival.
15. 2831 St Claude St.
Application: Christopher Reade, applicant; Preservation Alliance Of N O Inc, owner; Construct new gallery (canopy) to front and side elevations of existing two-story commercial building.
Motion: Elliott Perkins
Second: Robbie Cangelosi made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.
Result: Passed
In favor: Elliott Perkins, Cynthia Dubberley, Robbie Cangelosi, John Klingman
Opposed:
Comments:
16. 1013 Ninth St..
Application: James Brown, applicant; Leola Christy, owner; Review details of conceptually approved new construction of residential building.
Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the staff level. The roof pitch should be 7/12. The pane over panel door at the front elevation should not have lite divisions. The slip head windows should be wider, between 2'-10" and 3'-0". The window at the edge of the building on the second floor should be relocated or removed. All window cornices should be removed. The overhang at the side entrance needs to be restudied, the roof is too steep and it is located too high on the wall. The entablature is too low and should extend past the front wall of the building. Raising the column height at the second floor porch will create a more proportional building and get the entablature at the right location.
Second: Robbie Cangelosi
Result: Passed
In favor: Robbie Cangelosi, Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, John Klingman
Opposed:
Comments:

17. 2936 Esplanade Ave.
Application: Rama P Bhattacharya, applicant; Soc For Krishna Consciousness I Intern'l, owner; Installation of accessory structure patio carport cover in rear yard of existing building
Motion: Robbie Cangelosi made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.
Second: Cynthia Dubberley
Result: Passed
In favor: Robbie Cangelosi, Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, John Klingman
Opposed:
Comments:
18. 615 S Carrollton Ave.
Comments: This item was withdrawn.
19. 718 Charbonnet St.
Application: JL Remodeling, applicant; Gutters Tech La LLC, owner; New construction of a 1300 SF single-family residential building.
Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.
Second: Cynthia Dubberley
Result: Passed
In favor: Robbie Cangelosi, Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, John Klingman
Opposed:
Comments:
20. 905 Atlantic Ave.
Application: Michael Malcom, applicant; Jessica R Broussard, owner; Renovate existing one-story residential building and construct new camelback addition at rear.
Motion: Cynthia Dubberley made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with their recommendations and the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that the proposed column placement did not work well with the existing window and door openings. They suggested using five columns instead for four total bays. They also felt that a couple of small windows should be added to the front elevation of the camelback to help break up the visual mass of that wall.
Second: Robbie Cangelosi
Result: Passed
In favor: Robbie Cangelosi, Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, John Klingman
Opposed:
Comments:
21. 1230 Constance St..
Application: Cameron Richard, applicant; Eric S Patrick, owner; Renovation and camelback addition.
Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The addition is minimally visible and due to the site restraints the ARC agreed the location of the camelback was appropriate.
Second: Robbie Cangelosi
Result: Passed
In favor: Elliott Perkins, Cynthia Dubberley, Robbie Cangelosi, John Klingman
Opposed:
Comments:

22. 1447 Euterpe St.
Comments: This item was deferred until the applicant arrived.
23. 817 N Villere St.
Comments: This item was deferred until the applicant arrived.
24. 1001 Patterson St.
Comments: This item was deferred until the applicant arrived.
25. 1000 Delaronde St.
Comments: This item was deferred until the applicant arrived.
26. 313 Opelousas St.
Comments: This item was deferred until the applicant arrived.
27. 608 Sixth St.
Comments: This item was deferred until the applicant arrived.
28. 928 Clouet St.
Comments: This item was deferred until the applicant arrived.
29. 2625 Constance St.
Application: Robert Pell, applicant; Credit Shel Frankenheimer, owner; New construction of 2,600 sqft, single family residential building.
Speakers: Mike Dianda spoke against the application.
Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. Gutters should be attached to the building. Slip head windows at the front elevation should 2/4 configuration. Columns should be rectangular, 8"x6" and the newel posts at the second floor should be similar in size. A window should be added to the bump out portion facing Constance St. HVAC equipment at the front yard should be screened.
Second: Cynthia Dubberley
Result: Passed
In favor: Robbie Cangelosi, Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, John Klingman
Opposed:
Comments:
30. 820 Verret St.
Application: Robert Pell, applicant; 820 Verret St LLC, owner; Construct new, 910 SF addition to a one-story residential building.
Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with their recommendations and the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC recommended that the header height of the door opening at the new side entrance should align with the header height of the existing adjacent window openings. They also felt that the steps at that entrance should align with the door, not the window.
Second: Cynthia Dubberley
Result: Passed
In favor: Robbie Cangelosi, Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, John Klingman
Opposed:
Comments:

31. 1447 Euterpe St.

Application: Kirk Fabacher, applicant; Gregory L II Lacy, owner; Demolition of existing residential building and new construction of two story, single family, residential building.

Speaker: Marylen Costa spoke in opposition to the application.

Motion: Elliot Perkins and the ARC agreed that the review of the proposed redevelopment plan in no way supports the approval of the demolition of the existing historic structure. However, should the commission approve the demolition the ARC agreed that the proposed two story structure is appropriate provided that the stepped roof condition be reconfigured to a continuous ridgeline. The ARC noted that a camelback addition behind the main roof would be acceptable and that there is historic precedent for elevating a single story shotgun and constructing a new ground floor below. These options would be preferable to constructing a second story to the existing single story structure, as they will require less replacement of historic building fabric.

Second: Robbie Cangelosi

Result: Passed

In favor: Robbie Cangelosi, Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, John Klingman

Opposed:

Comments:

32. 817 N Villere St.

Application: Natalie Deliso, applicant; Schoen Fuselier Co., LLC, owner; New construction of a two-story 2,950 SF single-family residential primary building with two-story 770 SF residential accessory structure.

Motion: Robbie Cangelosi made a motion to defer a recommendation for conceptual approval. The ARC agreed that the building as proposed reads more as a commercial structure as opposed to a residential building. Further, the ARC felt that a major factor in this appearance is the lack of overhang projections, such as galleries or porches, and lack of setback shown on the plans. The ARC also agreed that the proposed materiality is not contextual to historic structures in the immediate vicinity. The ARC asked the applicant to consider sectional design moves which would accommodate parking in the front as the plans show, but also relate schematically to a raised basement typology. Look at neighboring structures for proportions, setbacks, overhangs, and materiality in addressing the issues above.

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Robbie Cangelosi, Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, John Klingman

Opposed:

Comments:

33. 1001 Patterson St.

Application: Wells One Investments, LLC, applicant; Patterson Drive 931 LLC, owner; Construct new two-story residential building.

Motion: Elliot Perkins made a motion to defer this application for additional review. The ARC made the following recommendations:

- The proportions of the building seem wide and short in comparison to the adjacent building. The floor-to-ceiling height and width of the building should be re-studied, and a streetscape elevation building should be provided to show how the building relates to its context, particularly the neighboring building.
- The windows at the second floor should be either full floor-length windows or should have a standard dimension and sill height.
- The 2'-0" trim band between the ground floor and the second floor needs to be simplified.
- The ground floor piers should be infilled between the front and rear porches to create a base for the building.
- Additional windows need to be added to the side elevations of the building, particularly on the Pacific Ave. side. At least one window at the second floor and one window at the third floor should be added.

Second: Robbie Cangelosi

Result: Passed

In favor: Robbie Cangelosi, Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, John Klingman

Opposed:

Comments:

34. 1000 Delaronde St.

Application: Wells One Investments, LLC, applicant; Stone Source International Inc, owner; Construct new two-story residential building.

Motion: Cynthia Dubberley made a motion to defer this application for additional review. The ARC made the following recommendations:

- The proportions of the building seem wide and short. The overall height of the building should be increased, or the massing should be broken up to make the building appear less boxy.
- The shed roof over the porch should be a lower pitch, with a metal roof covering.
- Four bays would work better with the width of the building than three bays. Five bays would also be acceptable.
- Additional windows need to be added to the side elevations of the building, towards the front corners.

Second: John Klingman

Result: Passed

In favor: Robbie Cangelosi, Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, John Klingman

Opposed:

Comments:

35. 313 Opelousas St.

Application: Damon Tyrus Reed, applicant; R2h Investments, LLC, owner; Renovate one-story residential building, including change of roof form over existing one-story side addition and construction of new camelback addition at rear.

Motion: Robbie Cangelosi made a motion to deny the application. The ARC agreed that they could not approve the camelback design and roof modifications as the new addition overwhelms the existing historic structure. They also felt that the drawings presented were not accurate in depicting the as-built conditions. The ARC recommended that the applicant apply for retention of the completed work to the full New Orleans HDLC Commission.

Second: Elliott Perkins

Result: Passed

In favor: Robbie Cangelosi, Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, John Klingman

Opposed:

Comments:

36. 608 Sixth St.

Application: Charles Berg, applicant; 608 6Th Street, LLC, owner; Renovation of single story, residential building and camelback addition.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC recommended that the applicant make sure that the existing conditions, including the roof pitch, are accurately drawn. The two story addition should be squared off at the corner, and roof made into a single hip to match the pitch of the existing. Window locations should be restudied so they are not at the edge of the building.

Second: Robbie Cangelosi

Result: Passed

In favor: Robbie Cangelosi, Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, John Klingman

Opposed:

Comments:

37. 928 Clouet St.

Application: Heather Mcvicar Ruoss, applicant; David L Toups, owner; Renovation of two-story residence including construction of new addition at rear.

Motion: Robbie Cangelosi made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Robbie Cangelosi, Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, John Klingman

Opposed:

Comments:

38. 1531 Ursulines St.

Application: Todd James, applicant; Re New Orleans Property Management LLC, owner; New Construction of a 3,500 SF multi-family residential building.

Speaker: Alvin Lacoste spoke neutrally regarding the application. Adolph Bynum spoke against the application.

Motion: Robbie Cangelosi made a motion to defer a recommendation for conceptual approval. The ARC agreed that the proposal does not appear to have appropriate proportions drawn as described by the applicant, or which would be appropriate for this building. They agreed that the applicant should investigate a more appropriate bay height or bay width; the bay width seems to be too wide for the number of columns on the façade. The ARC recommend the applicant consider:

- Including a context street elevation drawing to compare to the adjacent properties, specifically the property immediately adjacent.
- Increasing floor-to-floor height of ground floor.
- Adjusting bay height and width such that the bays become more tall and narrow.
- Increasing number of bays and make windows narrower.

Further, the ARC agreed that columns should be rectangular in plan with the wide face to the street. They recommended that the applicant study the adjacent property for the appropriate composition of the cornice as well as the relationship between the cornice and the roof. They also recommended that the depth of the porch should increase, and that the applicant reduce the number of materials visible from the public right of way; stucco and weatherboards should be sufficient.

Second: John Klingman

Result: Passed

In favor: Robbie Cangelosi, Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, John Klingman

Opposed:

Comments:

At this time John Klingman left the meeting.

39. 408 Delery St.

Application: Kristine Shull, applicant; Bast Realty Partners LLC, owner; New Construction of 1,600 SF single-family residential building.

Motion: Robbie Cangelosi made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

Second: Elliot Perkins

Result: Passed

In favor: Robbie Cangelosi, Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins

Opposed:

Comments:

40. 2427 Royal St.
Comments: This item was withdrawn to the end of the agenda.
41. 1806 S Carrollton St.
Application: Jack de la Vergne, applicant; Vintage Assets Inc, owner; Construct 140 SF addition
Motion: Robbie Cangelosi made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.
Second: Elliott Perkins
Result: Passed
In favor: Robbie Cangelosi, Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins
Opposed:
Comments:
42. 1035 Mazant St.
Application: Alexander Adamick, applicant; Carlos F Grasso, owner; Renovation of one-story residential building including new addition at rear.
Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC felt that since contemporary windows are being used at the new rear addition, there should also be a material change to distinguish the addition from the existing building. This could be either an alternate material or a different-sized lap siding, and the break should be marked by a cornerboard. If the same siding is used, then the windows should be more traditional to match the existing windows.
Second: Cynthia Dubberley
Result: Passed
In favor: Robbie Cangelosi, Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins
Opposed:
Comments:
43. 3919 Marais St.
Application: Mark Morice, applicant; Treyark Properties LLC, owner; Construction of new residential building.
Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the ARC level. The ARC made the following recommendations:
- The parking space should be located behind the front wall of the building (18'-0" minimum length).
 - As the mass of the building will need to be adjusted to accommodate the parking space, a more visible side entrance could be added behind the parking space, in the "L" of the first floor.
 - It is not advisable to install an unusable front porch and door at the front façade; however, if that is desired, the front porch should be reduced in depth. It would be preferable to have a usable door and a full, covered porch at the front of the building.
 - Steps cannot be built in the required 3'-0" side yards.
 - The front wall of the two-story camelback should be in a single plane, not split.
- Second: Robbie Cangelosi
Result: Passed
In favor: Robbie Cangelosi, Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins
Opposed:
Comments:

II. Remaining Deferred Items

43. 2427 Royal St.

Application: Kelly Johnson, applicant; 2427 Royal St LLC, owner; Renovation to include the removal of original stoop and one (1) entry door at front elevation.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Robbie Cangelosi, Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins

Opposed:

Comments:

43. 721 Tricou St.

Application: Ducar Real Estate Investments LLC, applicant/owner; New Construction of a 1,680 SF single-family residential building.

Motion: Robbie Cangelosi made a motion to defer this application for additional review.

Second: Elliott Perkins

Result: Passed

In favor: Robbie Cangelosi, Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins

Opposed:

Comments:

At this time, there being no further business to discuss, the meeting was adjourned.